Reviews

Itinerari e stratificazioni dei tropi: San Marco, l'Italia settentrionale e le regioni transalpine; Testi d'un convegno e di sessioni di studio negli anni 1992–1995 presso la Fondazione Ugo e Olga Levi, edited by Wulf Arlt and Giulio Cattin. Venice: Edizioni Fondazione Levi, 2008. xxii, 568 pp.

In one of my favorite Greek fables, a lioness and a she-wolf are in conversation. The wolf, proud of the recent litter of pups she has delivered, chides the lioness for having only one cub. The lioness replies: "Only one—but it's a lion."

In the present case the story seems doubly appropriate. The *raison d'être* for this volume and the conference that gave rise to it is a single manuscript, Berlin, Staatsbibliothek, mus. 40608, a gradual containing tropes for seventeen feasts of the liturgical year. The manuscript had been known among specialists for some time. What had not been known about it, until Giulio Cattin's striking discovery reported in 1990, was that it is one of the *codices dispersi* from the basilica of San Marco in Venice.[1] For the first time, scholars now have a manuscript with tropes from Venice, the one major center that had previously been noteworthy by its absence from maps of troping activity in northern Italy.[2]

The presence of a "new" document such as this clearly forces scholars to revise the picture of the liturgy at San Marco and the larger conceptual field of troping itself, as Wulf Arlt underscores in his introduction to this volume. Although Berlin 40608 shares most of its corpus of tropes with other northern Italian and even northern European sources, it also exhibits some distinctive features of its own.[3] Hence one of the purposes of the present volume is to situate this manuscript and its repertory in relation to other centers of troping, both in Italy and to the north. The centerpiece of the volume is an edition

1. Giulio Cattin, *Musica e liturgia a San Marco: Testi e melodie per la liturgia delle ore dal XII al XVII secolo; Dal graduale tropato del duecento ai graduali cinquecenteschi*, vols. 1–3 + indici (Venice: Edizioni Fondazione Levi, 1990–92), reviewed by Bonnie J. Blackburn in this ***Journal*** 47 (1994): 172–77. Cattin's story of the research leading to the discovery, reported in his "Il cammino d'una ricerca" (pp. xiii–xvi of *Itinerari e stratificazioni*), is captivating in its own right.

2. A good example of the old map is the one in *Corpus Troporum* [CT] III, *Tropes du propre de la messe, 2: Cycle de Pâques*, ed. Gunilla Björkvall, Gunilla Iversen, and Ritva Jonsson [Jacobsson] (Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1982), 8–9. The new map may be seen following p. 28 of *Itinerari e stratificazioni.*

3. One of these, discussed by Arlt on pp. 25–26 of his introduction, is the insertion of biblical or nonbiblical verses, rubricked with "Ps[alm]," in place of the normal Psalm verse following the Introit. These verses are set to Psalm tones, fully notated, and typically represent a continuation or elaboration of the text of the Introit itself.

of and commentary upon the Introit tropes in Berlin 40608, beginning with Christmas and proceeding through the liturgical year. In addition to the major feasts of the Temporale, the manuscript contains tropes for John the Baptist, Peter, Lawrence, Assumption, All Saints, Martin, and Andreas. (Remarkably, it does not contain tropes for Mark, probably because the liturgy for the evangelist was celebrated with its own *libellus*; see pp. 25 and 538–39.) The redoubtable Latinist Ritva Jacobsson (University of Stockholm) provides an introduction to, and editions of, all the trope texts in the manuscript. For each trope she first presents the edition of the text, interwoven with the complete text of its Introit. She then lists concordances to the text according to geographical regions, following a scheme developed by *Corpus Troporum*: East Frankish (St. Gall and Germany), Northwest and "Zone de transition" (England, northern France, and the region between the Seine and the Rhine), Southwestern (Aquitaine and Spain), and Northern and Southern Italian.[4] Following a translation of the trope with its Introit and a discussion of its textual sources, she analyzes the San Marco version of the trope as compared with concordant ones. Complementing her analyses of the texts are detailed commentaries on the music for each of the tropes, provided variously by Wulf Arlt, Bodil Asketorp, Andreas Haug, and Susan Rankin. Taken together, the essays constitute a rich, multifaceted investigation into the state of troping in the later Middle Ages; indeed, they could even be read as an introduction—albeit a highly sophisticated one—to the phenomenon of troping itself. One reason for this is that the Berlin manuscript, although it dates from the thirteenth century, preserves some practices that date back to the very earliest stages of trope composition in Europe. The essay on the tropes for Epiphany may serve as illustration.

For the Epiphany Introit *Ecce advenit*, Berlin 40608 has a complex of five elements. The introduction, *Hodie clarissimam*, appears in two other Italian sources (Benevento, Biblioteca capitolare VI. 35, and Verona, Biblioteca capitolare 107) and in seventeen East-Frankish ones; the four internal verses appear only in two of the earliest manuscripts from St. Gall, Stiftsbibliothek 484 and 381, and in only one other Italian source with neumes, Verona 107.[5] Jacobsson's edition and translation are as follows (pp. 283–84):

1. Hodie clarissimam secuti stellam,	Today the Magi, having followed the very brilliant star,
magi munera deferunt ad Christi cunabula,	offer gifts at the crib of Christ,

4. Cf. CT I, *Tropes du propre de la messe, 1: Cycle de Noël*, ed. Ritva Jonsson [Jacobsson] (Stockholm: Almqvist &Wiksell, 1975), 23 and 50; CT IV, *Tropes de l'Agnus Dei*, ed. Gunilla Iversen (Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1980), 26–27; and CT III/2, 33.

5. Benevento VI. 35 has the texts for all five elements, but neumes for only the first. Cf. Alejandro Enrique Planchart, ed., *Beneventanum Troporum Corpus I: Tropes of the Proper of the Mass from Southern Italy, A.D. 1000–1250* (Madison, WI: A-R Editions, 1994), Commentary (vol. 16, pp. 21–22); Edition (vol. 17–18, p. 55).

de quo prophete ventura predixerant:	of whom the prophets had predicted what should come:
ECCE AD[VENIT],	BEHOLD, HE HAS COME,
2. Olim quem vates antiqui cecinerunt	whom long ago the ancient prophets have sung
de virgine procreari,	that he would be begotten by a virgin,
DOMINATOR [DOMINUS],	THE SOVEREIGN LORD,
3. Qui montes in plana,	who is able to restore the mountains to level ground,
valles in celsa,	the valleys to heights,
potens est reparare;	
ET REGNUM [IN MANU EIUS],	AND KINGSHIP IS IN HIS HAND,
4. Ut regat suum populum in equitate,	that he shall lead his people in equity,
quos redemit precio sacri cruoris—	whom he redeemed with the price of his sacred blood—
ET POTESTAS	AND GOVERNMENT
5. Ad domandum anguem sevum,	to tame the wild serpent
qui nos pomi cibo decepit	who deceived us with the food of the apple
et sibi servos subiugavit—	and subjected us as slaves to himself—
ET IMPERIUM.	AND POWER.

Jacobsson introduces the complex by saying: "The text of this constellation is remarkable, both for its contents and its deficiencies" (p. 285). Unlike most trope texts for Epiphany, which typically deal with three events revealing the divinity of Christ—the appearance of the star, Christ's baptism, and the miracle of the wine at the wedding in Cana—this set witnesses only the first of these, and that only in the first element, *Hodie clarissimam*. With its hypotactic structure—*secuti* (followed), *deferunt* (offer), *predixerant* (had predicted): *ADVENIT* (has come)—its alliterative pairs marked by *a*-assonance—*secuti stellam*, *magi munera*, *Christi cunabula*, *prophete–predixerant*—and its temporal spectrum—present: *Hodie*, past: *predixerant*, and future: *ventura*—this introductory element is a mini-masterpiece of trope construction. One notices a sharp stylistic difference, though, between this element and the ones that follow it, a difference signaled by the fact that prophesy is thematicized in both the first and second elements. There is a reason for the thematic duplication and stylistic contrast: whereas the text of the first element was clearly an independent composition, composed and transmitted separately from the rest of the set, the four remaining trope elements originated as textings of preexistent melismas added to the Introit *Ecce advenit* in St. Gall manuscripts 484 and 381, dating from the mid-tenth century.[6] Wulf Arlt reminds us in his essay

6. A list of these melismatic insertions, or "meloform tropes," for Epiphany appears in Gunilla Björkvall and Andreas Haug, "Tropentypen in Sankt Gallen," in *Recherches nouvelles sur les tropes liturgiques*, ed. Wulf Arlt and Gunilla Björkvall, 119–74 (Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1993), at 143–45; and in Haug's article "Das ostfränkische Repertoire der meloformen Introitustropen," in *International Musicological Society Study Group Cantus Planus: Papers Read at the Fourth Meeting, Pécs, Hungary, 3–8 September 1990*, 413–26 (Budapest: Hungarian Academy of

on the music of this trope complex that the introductory *Hodie clarissimam* at St. Gall is itself a contrafactum of three other *Hodie* tropes, probably originating with the one for the Feast of Innocents, *Hodie pro domino*—EX ORE INFANTIUM.[7] And while diastematic readings of *Hodie clarissimam* may be found in five manuscripts, two from Italy and three from north of the Alps, diastematic versions of trope elements 2 through 5 appear in only one source: Berlin 40608. Arlt provides synoptic transcriptions of all extant settings of these four elements (pp. 294–95). Strikingly, the melodic readings of the San Marco manuscript are much closer to those from St. Gall than are those from the earlier Italian source, Verona 107. The parallels are exact in the first intercalated verse, *Olim quem vates*, and very close in the remaining three. At the same time, the San Marco readings show signs of stylistic appropriation (some parallels with the settings in Verona 107, rather than those from St. Gall) and melodic adjustment (e.g., the musical rhyme created by the last four notes of each element, D–F–E–D, a parallelism not found in St. Gall 484 and 381). Nonetheless, concludes Arlt, it is rather amazing that these elements were still being sung at San Marco in the thirteenth century, even though they are not documented in the North after the mid-tenth century, and they can be used to reconstruct with some confidence the intervallic progressions of the melodies at St. Gall itself.

Itinerari e stratificazioni would be worth its price for the edition and commentaries alone; each of the remaining sixteen essays on the tropes in the manuscript presents the same wealth of information and new insights as the one just described. But the volume offers much more. As an introduction to the edition of tropes in Berlin 40608, it includes five studies of various aspects of tropes and troping that provide a liturgical, musical, and philological context for the San Marco source. As the title of the book suggests, these essays are primarily concerned with tracing paths and layers of transmission between various areas of northern Europe and Italy.

Although it is not the source of the greatest number of tropes imported to Italy from the North, the monastery of St. Gall is nonetheless well represented in northern Italian tropers, including Berlin 40608. In his essay on the presence of the St. Gall repertoire from codices 484 and 381 in Italy up to the early twelfth century, Wulf Arlt (University of Basel) focuses on Verona 107, a manuscript copied in Mantua ca. 1000, and thus one of the oldest notated sources with tropes from upper Italy. In Arlt's case studies of Introit tropes, Verona 107 proves to be especially fertile as a source showing the extent to

---

Sciences, Institute for Musicology, 1992). Haug's catalog of these melismas as they appear in St. Gall manuscripts 484 and 381 appears in the inventory of the two manuscripts in Wulf Arlt and Susan Rankin, *Stiftsbibliothek Sankt Gallen: Codices 484 & 381*, 3 vols. (Winterthur, Switzerland: Amadeus, 1996), 1:177–281.

7. The link between *Hodie clarissimam* and *Hodie pro domino* was pointed out and discussed by Björkvall and Haug in "Tropentypen in Sankt Gallen," 126–29.

which St. Gall material was imported into northern Italy, and in turn offering new perspectives for the interpretation of the oldest St. Gall sources themselves. This is especially true of the meloform tropes (discussed above) that originated as melismas added to phrases of Proper chants at St. Gall. Verona 107 offers the first evidence of textings of some of these melismas that did not receive texts at St. Gall, and in one case presents evidence of St. Gall textings of the "Hodie" introduction for *Sacerdotes tui* (for St. Peter) along with four interior elements, for which there is only indirect evidence at the monastery itself.

Whereas Arlt's study treats the earliest layer of troping activity, Andreas Haug (University of Würzburg) pursues questions as to when and how early tropes from St. Gall and other northern centers could have found their way into the thirteenth-century manuscript from San Marco. He focuses specifically on tropes in southeastern Germany and the paths of transmission they could have followed to Aquileia and Cividale in northeastern Italy. On the basis of a careful sifting of manuscript evidence, facilitated greatly by the research leading to the publication of his recent catalog of *troparia tardiva*,[8] Haug is able to answer four questions he sets out at the beginning of his essay. He finds that: (1) the transfer of German tropes into northeastern Italy took place only in the later Middle Ages, between 1050 and 1200, or perhaps later; (2) tropes from northern Europe reached northeastern Italy not directly, but rather by way of centers in the southeastern region north of the Alps; (3) the paths from north to south led over the Alps not from the west, but from the east; and (4) the repertory of the trope manuscripts from Aquileia and Cividale was formed from two traditions, that of a short troparium of Haug's Type B_2, and that of Padua.[9]

Paths of a different kind attracted the interest of Susan Rankin (University of Cambridge), whose article traces the peregrinations of " 'Quem queritis' *en voyage* in Italy." She points out that while *Quem queritis* was most often sung as part of Matins in northern France, England, Lotharingia, and German-speaking regions, "the overwhelming pattern in northern, central and southern Italy was to integrate the dialogue into the liturgy for Easter mass as a trope" (p. 179). Rankin is especially concerned with the representation of the dialogue; performance at the altar between two groups of clerics or

8. *Troparia tardiva: Repertorium später Tropenquellen aus dem deutschsprachigen Raum* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1995).

9. Haug's findings thus run counter to Alejandro Planchart's assumption that there was earlier a rich and large repertory of tropes sung in this region. Cf. Planchart, "Notes on the Tropes in Manuscripts of the Rite of Aquileia," in *Essays on Medieval Music in Honor of David G. Hughes*, ed. Graeme M. Boone, 333–69 (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Department of Music, 1995), at 336, 346. Haug emphasizes, however, that he had the benefit not only of his own work on *Troparia tardiva*, but of Raffaella Camilot-Oswald's dissertation, *Die liturgischen Musikhandschriften aus dem mittelalterlichen Patriarchat Aquileia*, published as Teilband 1, Monumenta Monodica Medii Aevi, Subsidia 2/1 (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1997).

between a cantor and another pair of singers seems to have been the normal practice in Italy, as witnessed by virtually all the sources preserving rubrics with performance indications.[10] Apart from this, however, there are a number of textual variants that help provide a background against which Berlin 40608 can be considered. After setting out the various families of variants themselves and describing the ways in which the dialogue is contextualized, she turns to the ceremony as copied in the San Marco gradual, where it appears as a trope to the Introit *Resurrexi.* Appropriately, given the traditional symbol of St. Mark, one of the internal trope verses for the Introit itself is *Vicit leo de tribu Iuda radix Iesse* ("The lion from the tribe of Juda, root of Jesse, is victorious."). It is perhaps no wonder that the dialogue appears to have been in use at the basilica of San Marco longer than anywhere else in Europe, "a jewel," as Rankin puts it, "treasured by the Venetians for its own beauty" (p. 207).

The final pair of studies in *Itinerari e stratificazioni* are essays in Latin paleography and philology but go beyond the boundaries of those disciplines in both cases. The variety of early script forms—including uncials and Merovingian ligatures, as well as majuscules and Greek characters—that appear in the prosarium of the manuscript Oxford, Bodleian Library, Douce 222, copied at the cloister of Novalesa in the second half of the eleventh century, lead Martin Steinmann (University of Basel) to provide a capsule history of historicizing scripts on the continent, leading up to the humanistic minuscule that originated in Italy around 1400. He suggests that the scribe of Douce 222 may have been trying to provide a visual reminder of the apex of Novalesa's florescence during the eighth and ninth centuries in the wake of the Cluniac reform of the cloister that took place in the mid-eleventh century.

The study by Gunilla Björkvall (University of Stockholm) carries the title "French Tropes in Northern Italy," but it could just as well have been called "Sinn und Wesen der Tropen."[11] Björkvall offers a wonderful array of insights into the way tropes work, basing her discussion on tropes for Palm Sunday, Easter Sunday, and the feast for St. Stephen. For each set of tropes she provides an inventory of all the concordant sources, a presentation of early commentaries on the biblical texts either present or alluded to, an investigation into the possible paths of transmission, and a close examination of variant readings. The pleasures of the *apparatus criticus* become palpable in her dis-

10. The sole exception to this is Verona 107, which introduces and begins the dialogue as follows: "In die s[an]c[ta]m pa[s]che [*sic*] ad mis[sam] sint omnes ordinati in choro et incipiat cantor ita [in marg. dicens] Hora est spallite [*sic*] iubet domnus canere eia dicite R[e]s[pondet] scola. Quem queritis in sepulchro o cristicole R[e]s[pondet] cantor Hiesum nazarenum crucifixum o celicole" etc. (reproduced from CT III/2, p. 329). One would like to think the rubricator simply exchanged the designations "scola" and "cantor" by mistake. If one exchanges them back, the rubrics make perfectly good sense.

11. This is the title of a fine essay by Heinrich Husmann: "Sinn und Wesen der Tropen, veranschaulicht an den Introitustropen des Weihnachtsfestes," in "Wilibald Gurlitt zum siebzigsten Geburtstag," special issue, *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 16 (1959): 135–47.

cussion of CT trope element 65[a] for the Easter Introit:[12] *Abstuleras, miserate, manes [manum]; mihi reddita lux est*—POSUISTI SUPER ME MANUM TUAM, ALLELUIA ("You had removed death, o you who have mercy; the light has been given back to me. You have placed your hand upon me, Alleluia"; p. 52). The manuscripts sometimes substitute *manens* or *manum* for *manes*. All of these make sense, but not all make good sense. Björkvall points out that *manes* is an image borrowed from ancient mythology, meaning "the ghosts of the dead," here rendered as "death"—an appropriate reading in the context. *Manens*, understood as the present participle of the verb *manere*, "to remain," has the character of being a "Verschlimmbesserung," i.e., a correction resulting in a deterioration of the sense. The interpretation with *manum* leads to a contradiction: "on one hand, the idea that the Father 'took his hand away (i.e. from me)' is pertinent, on the other, it speaks against both the vocative 'miserate' 'you who have mercy' and the base text 'You have placed your hand upon me' " (p. 53). This is but one of a wealth of subtle readings that convey a vivid picture of the way tropes were originally written and understood.

As suggested above, this is a book so rich in information and insights that it can serve as an *accessus* to research on tropes in general. It is not the easiest read—it assumes a certain familiarity with CT numbers and other conventions of the discipline, as well as a good reading knowledge of German and Italian—but for anyone seeking information on the current state of scholarship on tropes, on the relationships between northern European and Italian manuscripts containing them, and on the picture of troping presented to us by the San Marco gradual, *Itinerari e stratificazioni* will be an indispensable source. It is indeed a signal achievement, one that honors both the manuscript itself and the city that inspired it.

CHARLES M. ATKINSON

The Singing of the New World: Indigenous Voice in the Era of European Contact, by Gary Tomlinson. New Perspectives in Music History and Criticism. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2007. ix, 220 pp.

The songs and dances of native peoples have powerfully attracted the attention of Europeans ever since they reached the continent known as the "New World." Yet far from actually listening to or understanding them, the Europeans regarded these songs as frightening, suspicious, incomprehensible practices that could be used to reflect on the "innocent" or "diabolic" otherness of the "Indian." By contrast, in *The Singing of the New World: Indigenous Voice in the Era of European Contact*, Gary Tomlinson proposes to go beyond

12. Superscript "a"s in the CT editions indicate a verse in hexameters.